

ABSTRACT

Muzylov O. V. Resentment policies in the construction and reproduction of collective memory in modern Ukraine. – Qualification scholarly paper: a manuscript.

Thesis submitted for obtaining the Doctor of Philosophy degree in Sociology, Speciality 054 – Sociology. V. N. Karazin Kharkiv National University of Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, Kharkiv, 2021.

The dissertation is devoted to the research of the phenomenon of resentment policies and their role in the process of construction and reproduction of collective memory. The relevance of this topic resides in rapid changes in economic, political, cultural, and religious realms, which characterize modern Ukrainian society. It is noticeable that the heroes of the past are replaced by fundamentally new figures who were previously either marginalized or almost erased from the collective memory of the Ukrainians. The heroization of the victims and the desire to receive compensation (both moral and material) for the losses are especially noticeable. We associate this with the conduct of resentment policies.

We suggest using this notion as one of the (narrower) varieties of «politics of memory». This notion is not only narrower, but also implies a different nature of the relationship between the parties. In fact, if the politics of memory are aimed at regulating the entire historical past, resentment policies appeal to tragic, traumatic episodes in history. Usually, the study of resentment primarily relates to psychology, in which it is considered solely as a model of behavior at the individual level. However, in modern conditions, the image reaches a new, group level. It is constructed as a theory, telling about the historical origins of conflicts between countries, ethnic and social groups,. At the same time, resentment policies are being implemented in the practical sphere. This is manifested through everyday practices, so the result is a persistent hostility towards the «offender».

First of all, the conduct of resentment policies is relevant to societies that are in a state of military or political conflict.

The ontological aspect of the problem situation is that political actors, which, *inter alia*, seek to increase their rating and achieve certain political and economic goals, may be interested in the implementation of resentment policies.

The epistemological aspect of the problem situation consists in an obvious lack of knowledge about the specific of the implementation of resentment policies: sources of information about the event, the mechanisms of its spread, etc. Traditional approaches to the study of resentment consider it as a compassionate attitude towards themselves and negative towards the aggressor. We propose to study this in more detail and focus on the practices of constructing images of the enemy and the victim, the implementation of various symbols and images through cinematograph, and the space of modern cities.

First of all, the theoretical and methodological achievements devoted to the phenomenon of collective memory were analyzed and organized. We see it as the foundation of resentment policies. The eclectic set of concepts was streamlined and analyzed from a critical paradigm perspective. Based on Halbwax's approach, which is the most appropriate in the context of our work, it can be emphasized that events from the past and present are closely interrelated. By highlighting key aspects of collective memory, this phenomenon is described as a set of knowledge about the past that includes information about common values, holidays, rituals, symbols, and heroes, passed down from one generation to another.

Next, an analysis of theoretical approaches to the study of policies of memory was analyzed. It is analyzed that policies of memory are primarily considered by researchers as a social construct. And this is exactly their narrower variety that we view as resentment policies. Resentment policies do not refer to the past in general, but only to its tragic aspects (traumas). Resentment policies are aimed at building a certain attitude to events and are necessarily related to trauma. That is, in the context of our work, policies aimed at resolving contradictions will not be relevant, because they pursue completely different goals.

It was found that resentment policies provide a conscious emphasis on traumatic experiences. They are aimed at constructing images of the enemy and the victim. Among the functions of resentment policies one can find a unification of society, its consolidation, etc. These processes are accompanied by the creating of an image of the enemy, which can be found both inside the state and abroad. However, the consolidation of one part of society leads to even more contradictions within another one. As a result, the reproduction of resentment policies leads to the polarization of different groups, especially if they do not share the same view of historical events.

Accordingly, resentment policies were conceptualized by us as a system of political action of a public nature aimed at preserving, representing, and transmitting knowledge about collective trauma, as well as constructing the image of the victim and the image of the enemy.

At the end of the theoretical section, the relationship between the main categories of the paper was specified. According to the results of theoretical analysis, it was found that information about the trauma is stored and transmitted in the collective memory and used in the conduct of policies of memory, or their narrower variety – the resentment policies. Memory is the foundation of resentment policies, storing information about traumatic events.

Next, we have selected two practical areas where resentment policies can be embodied. We have consciously abandoned the study of news as the main source of knowledge about trauma, and the analysis of the education system because its consequences are more long-term, and it is better to consider them later.

Instead, two areas, where resentment policies can be reproduced, have been identified. The first was the urban space. Urban space, just as resentment policies, is not static. It is constantly changing. New toponyms, objects, symbols appear in it. They reflect the current changes taking place in society. We should not omit the urban space when studying resentment policies, since this is where an individual regularly meets them. This is a house, daily routine, the road to work and back. The city is a part of life, of everyday life.

We have studied the reproduction forms of resentment policies in the urban space. They are manifested in monuments, toponyms, objects of small architectural form, graffiti, murals, and other symbols associated with traumatic events. These may be the names of famous battles, mentions of victims. The accumulation of a large number of monuments, toponyms, and other symbols dedicated to the image of one group allows to emphasize its status, significance for society.

Based on the concept of sociology of the city by V. Vakhshain, the paper emphasizes the fact that only those monuments, place names, and other objects that are associated with traumatic events can be considered as elements that construct resentment in the urban space. In the Ukrainian context, these are most often streets named after the victims of war, other hostilities, or victims of certain discrimination. Analysis of theoretical sources shows that toponyms and other symbols in urban space often perform the function of constructing the image of the victim. They are designed to show compassion for the victims.

The paper also considers the role of rituals as the means aimed at spreading collective resentment. The holding of memorial events contributes to the fact that the feeling of resentment is shared by more and more people. In the context of the practical reproduction of resentment policies, this is expressed in the fact that certain events create the attitude toward certain personalities as toward victims or heroes. This proves that these means are aimed at consolidating the myth.

Theoretical analysis has shown that in almost every locality resentment policies are constructed with regard to local characteristics. That is, in addition to the main symbols of resentment, which can be found in other locations, we can note symbols relevant only for a particular city or village.

The second chosen research field was cinema. Cinematograph is not just art, but also the most ideological part of mass culture. It is exactly in the movies where stereotypes and images, which then begin to be replicated en masse, are broadcasted. In addition, cinema, unlike other arts, offers ready-made images.

The choice of cinema is determined not only by the clarity of the images that are broadcasted but also by their impact on viewers. Remarks, quotes, images, etc. often move from the cinema screens into everyday life.

Focusing on the work of T. Adorno, E. Volkov, O. Ponomareva, M. Ferro and other authors, it was found that for many people films are one of the main sources of information about historical events. In cinema, a negative attitude towards the antagonist can be exaggerated, which creates his distorted image, which is transferred from the screen to life.

In film, resentment policies are embodied in several forms. For example, in the creation of images of the enemy and the victim, demonstrations of extreme cruelty and contempt for state symbols, demonstrations of hatred for the people or their representatives.

It was also decided to conduct an empirical study based on two areas of policy reproduction. The analysis of film distribution was carried out using critical-discourse analysis and the semiotic method. A total of 78 films were analyzed. The analyzed films were divided into two slots. The first is 2010-2013, the second is 2014-2019. Such time intervals were chosen due to significant political changes that took place in Ukraine (in particular, the election of a new President). The main theme of both slots is World War II. Only now, if in the first group of films to this theme refer mostly Russian-made films, then in the second group – American and European. Among other topics raised in the films, one can find the First World War and racism. That is, the main themes of the two analyzed periods are almost indistinguishable.

Discourse analysis has shown that the main changes that have taken place in the distribution are related to the emergence of films about current political events in Ukraine. Documentaries about the events of the Euromaidan period appeared in 2014. The feature films came out a little later, in 2017. For a relatively short period, several paintings were published on the subject of anti-terrorist operation. These are «Cyborgs», «Donbas», «Callsign Banderas», «Ilovaisk 2014. Donbas Battalion». In addition, it can be noted that this line of films was continued in

2020-21, when, despite all the difficulties associated with distribution, several films on the subject of anti-terrorist operation were released: «Cherkasy», «Our Cats», «Skhidniak». It is noteworthy that all these films' (except for the film «Donbas») were fully or partially funded by the Ukrainian budget.

A characteristic feature of all analyzed Ukrainian films is the creation of the image of the enemy in relation to the military enemy, residents of Donetsk and Luhansk regions. In particular, their contemptuous attitude to the Ukrainian language and culture is demonstrated. Another notable aspect is the presence of several motion pictures with condemnation of the communist regime, in which a collective resentment to the USSR is constructed. This can be seen in the motion picture «The Secret Diary of Simon Petliura», «Chervony», «Kruty 1918». Their release took place in 2017-18 and also allows to create a picture that shows the contemptuous and discriminatory attitude towards Ukrainians in the revolutionary times and the Soviet period.

Empirical research shows that in Ukrainian cinema resentment policies are albeit not massively, but purposefully embodied. In particular, in relation to the external enemy, as well as to the locals The number of such pictures is growing, as is the integrity of the images displayed on the screen.

Kharkiv's urban space was chosen as a place to study the reproduction of resentment policies. The study was conducted on the basis of the method of inclusive observation, in particular, in the understanding of M. De Certeau (May-November 2020). We focused our attention on the emergence of new symbols that appeared after 2014, as a reaction to the social and political changes that have taken place in the city and the country. Thus, the study showed that in Kharkiv there appeared: 1) new toponyms named after the victims of the Revolution of Dignity and ATO (streets, names of public transport stops), in particular Zubenko, Paraschuk, Kotlyar, Topchiyy, Plokhodko, Usenko streets; 2) monuments dedicated to the victims of the ATO (monument to the defenders of Ukraine near the metro station «Zakhysnykiv Ukrainy», busts of S. Kolodiy and O. Lavrenko on the territory of the Military Institute of Tank Troops of NTU «KhPI»); 3) memorial

plaques in honor of the victims of the Revolution of Dignity (Zubenko, Paraschuk, etc.).

There were also more remarkable forms. A good example is the tent «Everything for Victory». It actively demonstrates the symbols of actions marked as crimes committed by Russia against Ukraine and other states. The presence of a missile on the territory of the complex is called to reinforce the resentment and , to remind about the fighting. Also noteworthy is the fact that the tent is located in the heart of the city, so it is encountered daily by a large number of Kharkiv residents and guests of the city, which thus helps them to recreate the traumatic experience. The renamings are political and, in the Ukrainian case, ideological in nature. That is, such reproduction of resentment policies is an attempt to consolidate the significance of exact resentment, the primary role of which is allocated by the state.

The study shows that several toponyms (6) dedicated to the victims of the Revolution of Dignity and the Anti-Terrorist Operation have appeared in the urban space of Kharkiv. In addition, new monuments have appeared in the city space: a monument to the defenders of Ukraine near the metro station «Zakhysnykiv Ukrainy», busts of S. Kolodiy and O. Lavrenko on the territory of the Military Institute of Tank Troops NTU «KhPI», tent «Everything for Victory». Their ideological affinity allows us to say that the urban space of Kharkiv embodied resentment policies that are aimed at consolidating certain images (in particular, the image of the victim in relation to the militants and those killed during the Revolution of Dignity).

The scientific novelty of the obtained results lies in the solution of an important scientific problem – the conceptualization of the phenomenon of resentment policies, the means of its construction, and the specific features of its reproduction. The main provisions of scientific novelty:

For the first time:

– resentment policies are conceptualized as a system of political action of a public nature and aimed at preserving, representing, and transmitting knowledge

about collective trauma, as well as constructing the image of the victim in relation to his own group and the image of the enemy against the offender. Policies are based on both real and fictional facts. Both current events and historical analogies are used to construct and approve them;

- certain forms of reproduction of resentment policies in the urban space, as «strategies» used by actors to achieve a certain political goal, are defined. To these forms belong monuments, toponyms, objects of small architectural form, graffiti, murals, and other symbols that are associated with traumatic events. These are the names of famous battles, mentions of victims. The accumulation of a large number of monuments, toponyms and other symbols dedicated to the image of one group, allows to emphasize its status and significance for society;

- a system of indicators for the display of resentment policies in cinema was developed and applied. These indicators are: creating images of the enemy and the victim, demonstration of hatred by the film's characters (mostly negative) to a certain people and/or its representatives, constructing a certain attitude to the event (assigning it with a historical significance), demonstration of collective revenge (unfolds as in physical reprisal against the enemy, as in legal punishment for the aggressor). The use of a significant number of these techniques (3 or more) allows to construct a sharply negative attitude towards the offender, to deepen the existing contradictions between groups.

Improved:

- the theory of interactive rituals Collins R. It was clarified that holding of commemorative events is not only a structured mechanism of interaction between individuals, but these events contribute to the spread of the resentment among many people. The success of rituals depends on a combination of variable elements, where the core role is played by conjuncture. In the context of the practical reproduction of resentment policies, this is expressed in the fact that the events create a certain attitude to certain personalities as to victims and heroes . That is, such events are aimed at consolidating the myth. Each new ritual can increasingly mythologize the event: there will appear all the new «facts» and

information that are considered relevant now. Thus, by disclosing such information, you can re-actualize the previous injury;

- the relationship between the phenomena of «collective memory», «collective trauma», «policies of memory» and «resentment policies», namely: information about the trauma is stored and transmitted in collective memory and used in policies of memory, or in their narrower variety – the resentment policies. Collective memory is the foundation of resentment policies, storing information about traumatic events. Among other functions, collective memory is designed to store and transmit knowledge about collective trauma from generation to generation. Resentment policies are based on information about trauma;

- the approach of E. Volkov and O. Ponomareva to the analysis of feature cinema as a source of collective memory. A mythologizing function has been added to the functions of cinema in the context of resentment policies. It is relevant only in the presence of real conflict between countries, social groups, ethnic groups. If they see negative images on the screen, and there is a conflict in real life, it increases the likelihood of constructing a negative image in relation to the «offender».

Received further development :

- sociological knowledge about the current state of Ukrainian film distribution: in particular, it was investigated that the events of 2014 became a catalyst for the reproduction of resentment policies, which is especially noticeable in the films of Ukrainian production. In particular, the active use of images of the enemy and the victim is unfolding: in military pictures, dramas dedicated to historical figures;

- sociological knowledge about the symbolic space of Kharkiv. It was revealed that the implementation of resentment policies after 2014 is happening due to: the establishment of new toponyms named after the victims of the Revolution of Dignity and the ATO; emergence of new monuments (for example, in honor of soldiers who died in the anti-terrorist operation); appearance of other symbols (for example, the tent «Everything for victory», the mural «We remember

– we win»). In addition, resentment policies are reproduced by replacing old symbols with new ones and adding new symbols to existing objects;

– the study of the dialectic of cities Buza A. The author's ideas on the localization of symbols used in urban space have been developed. In particular in the context of reproduction of resentment this is expressed in marking the city's space in honor of local «victims», who lost their lives as a result of the struggle for independence. As a result, local residents feel involved in national-level events.

The practical significance of the dissertation is that the results can be used in the policy of urban space labeling, strategies for teaching subjects in school (especially history), national policy in general. The information will be useful to organizations working with vulnerable groups, psychologists. Data on the reproduction of resentment policies can be useful for state and regional authorities (including social). Information on the functions of resentment policies can be used to increase social cohesion, remove barriers between different groups. The work can also be useful in the context of studying the growing popularity of radical ideas. Information on the implementation of resentment policies can be useful for conducting procedures aimed at preserving national security in general. The materials of the dissertation can be used in the preparation and teaching of such courses as: «Political Sociology», «Critical Sociology», «Theories of Revolutions», «Political Culture and Political Behavior» and others.

Key words: resentment policies, collective memory, collective trauma, policies of memory, collective resentment, cinematograph, city, discourse, enemy, victim.